


Minutes of the Graduate Council  
March 4, 2020

Members in Attendance:  
Amy Freund (left early)



changing program CIP codes. Dr. Quick explained that, although the Graduate Council may be involved

[REDACTED]

- x Procedures for Selecting Graduate Council members in academic year 2020 and beyond: This item was tabled for the next meeting, but Dean Quick emphasized the importance of this item for the Council's consideration.

- x Meeting adjourned.

Addendum: Proposals voted on by email

The following proposals were revised with input from the Graduate Council members present at the March 4 meeting. They were presented to the Council for vote online with a deadline for voting of March 23.

- x Review of Registrar Forms for Ph.D. Students: add/drop and other Registrar forms that require a "school signature" will be forwarded by departments to the Moody School. The Assistant Dean of the Moody School will sign the form and forward it to the Registrar for processing.

10 votes in favor, 0 against, 2 did not vote. The motion is approved.

- x Approval of Candidacy for Ph.D. Students: Candidacy forms, signed by the Director of Graduate Studies or Department Chair, will be forwarded to the Moody School, so that the Moody School can add milestones to the student's transcript. This will allow for tracking of candidacy for data purposes, recognition at candidacy reception, and tracking of progress to degree. Tracking progress to degree will allow the Moody School to alert departments/programs when students are close to limits prescribed in the catalog so a time

or graduation after advancing to candidacy, the department/program will forward a petition for an extension (generally a one-year extension) to the timeline to the Moody School along with a letter of support from the DGS or Department Chair. The Moody School will approve extension requests and share a record of the approval with the program/department and the school.

10 votes in favor, 0 against, 2 did not vote. The motion is approved.

- x Awarding and Disbursing Ph.D. Dissertation Completion Fellowships: Dissertating students in all Ph.D. programs will be eligible for these awards.

9 votes in favor, 1 against, 2 did not vote. The motion is approved.

- x Working with ISSS to Process International Graduate Student and Postdoc Paperwork: The Moody School will primarily play an advocacy role on behalf of international graduate students and the programs that enroll them. Schools and departments will continue to work with ISSS on this process. The Assistant Dean of the Moody School may be included in communications and asked to provide support for departments and schools in working on time-sensitive issues involving international student paperwork.


10 votes in favor, 0 against, 2 did not vote. The motion is approved.

- x Dissertation Formatting Guidance and Checks for Ph.D. Students: Lyle and Meadows will continue to check formatting for their student's dissertations and provide guidance to students on formatting issues. The Moody School will review formatting for Education Ph.D. students' dissertations using the same standards currently used for Dedman Ph.D. students. The current Graduate Studies formatting guides will be revised to reflect the fact that they are used by all Ph.D. programs except for those in the Lyle School of Engineering.

9 votes in favor, 1 against, 2 did not vote. The motion is approved.

- x Approval of Graduation and Collection of Graduation Surveys for Ph.D. Students: The Moody School will be responsible for collecting Survey of Earned Doctorates information. The Moody School will coordinate with departments and the Registrar's office on final graduation lists for Ph.D. students. Coordinating the graduation list will assist the Moody School in recognizing doctoral graduates at the graduation dinner or at a hooding ceremony instituted in the future. Collecting Survey of Earned Doctorates information will allow for accurate tracking of graduation statistics and accurate, uniform responses to Survey of Earned Doctorates requests for information.

10 votes in favor, 0 against, 2 did not vote. The motion is approved.

- 
- x Responsible Conduct of Research Training for Graduate Students and Postdocs. All Ph.D. students and postdocs will be required to do 8 hours of in-person training in their first year. Ph.D. students and postdocs will do a four-hour core course (led by ORGS) plus two-hour faculty-led electives spread across their first year. Master's students funded on federal grants will be required to do the same as above. Other master's students in programs that require theses will be required to complete CITI online responsible conduct of research training in their first year. The Moody School will recruit and compensate faculty in different disciplines to develop electives relevant to research in their disciplines. Responsible Conduct of Research Training will be added as a credit hour course on students' transcripts for those who have completed the in-person training.

After online discussion, this item is tabled until the next meeting

- x Additional Responsible Conduct of Research Training Proposal: All graduate students and postdocs who are required to complete the in-person responsible conduct of research WILL ALSO be required to complete CITI online training in their first year.

After online discussion, this item is tabled until the next meeting

# Graduate Council Meeting

March 4, 2020, 1:00-2:50pm

Annette Caldwell Simmons Hall 208

World Changers  
Shaped Here



SMU

---







Final review of Ph.D. applications and release of offer letters



---



- 
- a) Offers for postdoctoral positions can be initiated and made by a dean of any school, provided that funding is either in hand or the anticipated availability of funding for this purpose has been confirmed by the Office of Research; and
  - b) An individual shall serve as a postdoctoral scholar at SMU for no more than five years in total; and
  - c) Postdoctoral appointments shall be for no more than a one-year term, with the possibility of reappointment at the dean and faculty mentor's discretion at the end of each term up to the five-year limit; and
  - d) Offers for postdoctoral positions made before verified funding is in hand will be made contingent upon the availability of funds; and
  - e) Before making an offer for a postdoctoral position funded by a grant or other external source and





## Review of registrar forms, approval of candidacy

- Late add/drop and other Registrar forms that require a “school signature” will be forwarded by departments to the School Dean’s Office for review and signature and then to the Moody School. The Assistant Dean of the Moody School will sign the form and forward it to the Registrar for processing.
- Candidacy forms, signed by the Director of Graduate Studies or Department Chair, will be forwarded to the Moody School, so that the Moody School can add milestones to the student’s transcript. This will allow support accurate tracking of candidacy for data purposes, recognition at candidacy reception, and tracking of progress to degree. Tracking progress to degree will allow the Moody School to alert departments/programs when students are close to limits prescribed in the catalog so a timeline extension may be considered.





---

## Review of timeline extensions for advancement to candidacy and graduation

- When a student is nearing the limit set in the catalog for advancement to candidacy or graduation after advancing to candidacy, the department/program will forward a petition for an extension (generally a one-year extension) to the timeline to the Moody School along



---

## Dissertation formatting guidance and checks

- Lyle **and Meadows** will continue to check formatting for their student's dissertations and provide guidance to students on formatting issues. The Moody School will review formatting for Art History Ph.D. and Education Ph.D. students' dissertations using the same standards currently used for Dedman Ph.D. students.

## Approval of graduation, collection of graduation surveys

- The Moody School will be responsible for collecting





---

## Awarding and disbursing dissertation completion fellowships

- Ph.D. students in Lyle, Simmons, and Meadows will now be eligible for these awards. The award budget will be increased to allow for a larger target number of awards each year to accommodate additional students from these schools. Typically, about 10 awards have been made per year. This number should increase to about 14 awards per year.

## Working with ISSS to process international student and postdoc paperwork

- The Moody School will primarily play an advocacy role on behalf of international graduate students and the programs that enroll them. Schools and departments will continue to



---

## How Taking On Administrative Functions Supports the Goals of the University

- “The Task Force was in complete agreement that the role of a graduate school should be focused on facilitating program success and efficiency, ensuring financial support, and providing oversight of University standards for graduate education, but should not reduce Task Force’s important faculty responsibilities in creati, 0.494 m -0.5a29.6 ( )].2 (g)-0.6 (h)-5429.n420”





- 
- Thank you to the committee for carefully reviewing and ranking the nominations!
  - Spreadsheets are available in Box.
  - Those ranked “1” are in the definite fund category.
  - University Ph.D. Fellowship nominees ranked 20-30 may be offered a fellowship right away or may be waitlisted.
  -





---





---

## NIH Requirements

- “NIH requires that all trainees, fellows, participants, and scholars receiving support through any NIH training, career development award (individual or institutional), research education grant, and dissertation research grant must receive instruction in responsible conduct of research.”
- Training must include in-person component.
- Training must be for at least 8 hours. It is recommended that this be spread out.
- Training should be for at least 8 hours. It is recommended that this be spread out.





## NSF Requirements

- Requires that institutions “have a plan in place to provide appropriate training and oversight in the responsible and ethical conduct of research to undergraduates, graduate students, and postdoctoral researchers who will be supported by NSF to conduct research.”
- Requires that institutions certify this on each proposal.
- Does not prescribe any form that RCR training must take.
- Source: Proposal and Award Policies and Procedures Guide:  
[https://www.nsf.gov/pubs/policydocs/pappg19\\_1/index.jsp](https://www.nsf.gov/pubs/policydocs/pappg19_1/index.jsp)





---

## Duke University

- Only does in-person training

- AI1599 (e)-0.6 (s)-2. (n)]TJ 0 414TJ 0 41.001 Tw 19.98 -0 0 19.271 >>BD.nrn42371 >>BD.271v>>B



---

## Vanderbilt University

- All Ph.D. and Master's Students (in programs requiring a thesis) do CITI online AND in-person RCR training in their first year
- Science and engineering students do a full-day (8-hour) class including elective sections
- Humanities students do a half-day class
- 



---

## Notre Dame

- Offers an in-person 8-hour RCR training course in January every year
- All STEM



## Northwestern

- McCormick School of Engineering: All Ph.D.s complete CITI training and a five-week, 10-hour total “Responsible Conduct of Research for Engineers” course in their first year; master’s students funded on federal grants do both kinds of training too
- Weinberg College of Arts and Sciences: Graduate students funded on federal grants do CITI training plus four hours of in-person training offered by their home department



## Key Takeaways

- SMU is not currently following NIH requirements and recommendations– in particular on faculty participation, training for scholars at all levels (including postdocs), and in spreading training out over multiple sessions.
- We are behind our aspirational peers in only making NSF-funded students do the training and in not following the NIH requirements and recommendations.
- We don't have accurate records of students who have done the training or students who need it, according to our current procedure.
- SMU's current training is “one size fits all”– all students get the same training, regardless of discipline.



## Proposal:

- Require that all Ph.D. students and postdocs do 8 hours of in-person training in their first year
- Have Ph.D. students and postdocs do a four-hour core course (led by ORGS) plus two two-hour faculty-led electives spread across their first year
- Require master's students funded on federal grants to do the same
- Require other master's students in programs that require theses to complete CITI training in their first year
- Recruit and compensate faculty in different disciplines to develop electives relevant to research in their disciplines
- Add RCR as a course on students' transcripts







---

## Rationale for annual evaluations

- Early/prompt identification and remediation of problems
- Identify and document problems that commonly derail students, but which often fly "under the radar" longer than they should
- Efficient use of institutional resources (stipends)
- Best practices
  - Annual performance review
  -



---



## Informing students

- Students should be
  - informed beforehand (e.g., student handbook) about evaluations
  - Provided with forms and instructions regarding materials to be submitted
    - Snapshot of progress toward degree, CV, etc.
- One faculty member should provide program feedback to the student
  - Note successes
  - Address problems/deficiencies
    - Remediation plan w/clear definition of success
    - Timeline for remediation
    - What will happen if problems recur or are not resolved



